# An Assessment of Good Governance in Ethiopian Civil Service: The Case of Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service

# **Submitted in Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Masters Degree of Public Administration**

Mulusew Ayalneh Melesse

Enrolment No; 109100877

Supervised by; Mr. Elias Birhanu

**Master of Arts (Public Administration)** 

**Indra Gandhi National Open University** 

# **CERTIFCATE OF ACCEPTANCE**

Certified that the Dissertation entitled "An Assessment of Good Governance in Ethiopian Civil Service: The Case of Ethiopian Civil Service Ministry" submitted by Mulusew Ayalneh Melesse is his own work and has been done under my supervision. It is recommended that this Dissertation be placed before the examiner for evaluation.

| Signature of the Academic Supervisor;     |
|---|
| •   |
| Name: Elias Birhanu                       |
|   |
| Address:                                  |
|   |
| Study Center: St. Mary University College |
| Regional Center:                          |
| Regional Center.                          |
| Data                                      |

# **CONTENTS**

|      |             | Page No                                 |
|------|-------------|---|
| DEC  | LAR         | RATIONi                                 |
| ACK  | NOV         | WLAGMENTSii                             |
| LIST | r <b>of</b> | TABLESiii                               |
| ACR  | ONY         | YMSi                                    |
| ABS  | TRA         | CTv                                     |
|      |             | CHAPTER ONE                             |
| 1. I | ntrod       | duction1                                |
| 1.1  | Bac         | ckground of the Study1                  |
| 1.2  | Sta         | tement of the Problem2                  |
| 1.3  | Obj         | jective of the Study3                   |
| 1    | .3.1        | General Objective3                      |
| 1    | .3.2        | Specific Objectives3                    |
| 1.4  | Sig         | nificance of the Study4                 |
| 1.5  | Sco         | ope and Limitation of the Study4        |
| 1.6  | Me          | thodology5                              |
| 1    | .6.1        | Research Design5                        |
| 1    | .6.2        | Sources and Methods of Data Collection5 |
| 1    | .6.3        | Sampling Design5                        |
| 1    | .6.4        | Data Analysis Method6                   |
| 1.7  | Out         | tline of the study6                     |
|      |             | CHAPTER TWO                             |
| 2. L | itera       | nture Review7                           |
| 2.1  | Int         | troduction7                             |
| 2.2  | Th          | ne Concept of Good Governance7          |
| 2.3  | Th          | ne Public Sector Service9               |
| 2.4  | Im          | proving Public Sector Management10      |
| 2.5  | Ch          | naracteristics of Good Governance12     |
| 2.6  | Pr          | inciples of Organizational Governance16 |

| 2  | .7 R   | ole of the Civil Service Institutions   | <b>-</b> 21 |
|----|--------|---|-------------|
|    | 2.7.1  | Citizen Charter Statements  | -22         |
|    | 2.7.2  | Civil Service Reform  | -23         |
|    | 2.7.3  | Promoting a Culture of Good Governance Through Values and Outcome Based Ethics        |             |
|    | 2.7.4  | Implementation of Performance Measures  | <b>-</b> 29 |
| 2  | .8 Si  | gnificance of Good Governance in the Public Sector                                    | -30         |
|    |        | CHAPTER THREE   |             |
| 3. | Resul  | ts and Discussions  | -33         |
| 3  | .1 O   | rganizational Profile   | -33         |
| 3  | 3.2 D  | ata Presentation and Analysis   | 34          |
|    | 3.2.1  | Respondents by Gender and Work Position   | -34         |
|    | 3.2.2  | Respondents by Educational Status and Service Year                                    | -35         |
|    | 3.2.3  | MCS's Employee Conceptual Assessment about Good Governance                            | -35         |
|    | 3.2.4  | Assessment of the Practice of Good Governance in MCS                                  | -37         |
|    | 3.2.5  | MCS's Service Delivery for the Public   | <b>-</b> 37 |
|    | 3.2.6  | Participation, Consensus Oriented, Transparency and Rule of Law                       | 38          |
|    | 3.2.7  | Transparency, Equity and Inclusiveness, Accountability, Efficiency and Effectiveness- | 40          |
|    | 3.2.8  | MCS Employees' Organizational Information Access                                      | <b>-</b> 42 |
|    | 3.2.9  | Shared Values at MCS  | -44         |
|    | 3.2.10 | Ethical Based Behaviors in MCS  | -45         |
|    | 3.2.1  | Structure and Formal Working Procedures of MCS  | -46         |
|    | 3.2.12 | 2 Introduction of Citizen Charter in MCS  | 47          |
|    |        | CHAPTER FOUR  |             |
| 4. | Conc   | lusion and Recommendation   | 49          |
| 4  | .1 C   | onclusion   | 49          |
| 4  | .2 R   | ecommendation   | <b>-</b> 50 |
|    | 4.2.1  | Enhancing Institutional Good Governance   | <b>-</b> 50 |
|    | 4.2.2  | Enhancing the Structure and Formal Working Procedures                                 | 50          |
| Re | ferenc | es  | -52         |
| An | nex    |   | -55         |

## **DECLARATION**

I, Mulusew Ayalneh Melesse, hereby declare that the Masters Degree thesis entitled "An Assessment of Good Governance in Ethiopian Civil Service (A Case Study in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service)" submitted to the Indira Gandhi Open National University, is the result of my own efforts under my advisor's direction except for the references cited, and has not been submitted in any other academic institutions for any Degree.

.....

Mulusew Ayalneh

11, June 2013

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First and for most, I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my advisor Mr. Elias Birhanu next to my God and His blessed Mother, for his continuous advice and guidance.

Then, I would like to thank Ato Getachew Abdisa, Ethics Officer in the Ministry of Civil Service and his subordinates who were very cooperative in helping me by distributing and collecting the questionnaire.

# LIST OF TABLES

| Pages   |
|---|
| Table 3.1 Bio-Data of MCS Respondents   |
| Table 3.2 MCS Employees Conceptual Assessment on Good Governance  |
| Table 3.3 MCS Employees' Perception on the Presence of Good Governance                                    |
| Table 3.4 MCS's Service Delivery  |
| Table 3.5 Status of Participation, Consensus Oriented, Transparency and Rule of Law39                     |
| Table 3.6 Status of Transparency, Equity and Inclusiveness, Accountability, Efficiency and  Effectiveness |
| Table 3.7 MCS Employees' Organizational Information Access  |
| Table 3.8 Employees Perception of Shared Values   |
| Table 3.9 Employees Ethical Based Behaviors   |
| Table 3.10 View of Respondents on Structural Arrangements and Working Procedures in MCS                   |
| Table 3.11Introduction of the Citizen Charter in MCS48  |

#### **ACRONYMS**

MCS; Ministry of Civil Service

CSR; Civil Service Reform

BSC; Balanced Scored Card

CC; Citizen Charter

GDP; Gross Domestic Product

UNDP; United Nations Development Program

UN; United nations

CPA; Central Personnel Agency

PSC; Public Service Commission

FDRE; Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

FCSC; Federal Civil Service Commission

#### **ABSTRACT**

The term good governance is defined as the power exercised for effective conduct of a country's economy and social resources. Governance is good when it is able to attain this objective. The civil service is an essential sector for the functioning of government and has long been regarded as the frame of administration, seen as being critical to the growth and development of a nation.

The objective of this study was to assess good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service. Various good governance literatures were combined in terms of civil service delivery. Quantitative method is employed to find out the proposed objectives. Both primary and secondary sources of data were used to get comprehensive picture of the reality.

The paper investigates the employees conceptual understanding about good governance; the perception of institutional good governance practice; the status of institutional service delivery; the practice of the characteristics of good governance; organizational information access; feelings on organizational shared values; feelings on institutional ethical based behaviors; views about the existence of well established structural arrangements and working procedures; and the introduction of citizen charter in the Ministry of Civil Service.

The study argues that, equality and accountability should exist in the good governance. Good governance requires fair legal frame works that are enforced impartially. The rules and regulations should be clear and friendly enough to the general public and should also motivate the civil servants to follow. In rapidly changing context where efficiency, effectiveness and competence of government institutions are being questioned, it is imperative for the public service to strive for improvement in performance. Improving citizens' access to information and their participation in the governance process would lead to greater accountability, transparency and improved service delivery mechanisms.

Therefore, the study concludes that, good governance practice in Ethiopian Civil Service Ministry is in the infant stage, because effective and efficient mobilization of the human resource is not done significantly.

#### **CHAPTER ONE**

#### 1. Introduction

#### 1.1 Background of the Study

United Nation Development Program (UNDP) 1998 defines governance as the process whereby the organizations or resources are managed with the insurance of participation, transparency, accountability and the rule of the law, which determine the path for sustainable change. It means ruling system consists of delegation of authority, power decentralization, people's participation, and group/stakeholder dynamism in level of participation, idea sharing and decision-making.

Good Governance is a key element in development and in ensuring that globalization of all benefits in society. The state, in partnership with civil society and private sector, has a major role to play in the quest for peace, greater freedom, social equity and sustainable development. It also includes awareness at operational level, inclusiveness, transparency and accountability. These elements are mutually reinforcing and cannot stand alone. Good governance also promotes the rule of law (Shrestha, 2000). Here, governance is described "the process of decision making and the process by which decisions are implemented or not implemented and it can apply to corporate, international, national, local governance or to the interactions between other sectors of society".

These days, it is generally accepted that, good governance is an essential precondition for sustainable development. Various countries that are quite similar in terms of their natural resources and social structure have shown strikingly different performance in improving the welfare of their people. Much of this is attributable to standards of governance.

Poor governance stifles and impedes development, where there is corruption, poor control of public funds, lack of accountability, abuses of human rights and excessive military influence. (Downer, 2000).

A landmark study by the World Bank, (1998), demonstrated the crucial role that good governance plays in enhancing the effectiveness of resource utilization. The study found that where there is sound country management, an additional one percent of GDP translated into a

one percent decline in poverty whereas, in a weak policy and management environment, it has much less impact.

Findings like this clearly indicate that, the returns from development assistance are generally greater in developing countries to enhance good governance. One element of good governance that is needed for sustained development is an economy that operates in an ethical, accountable and appropriately regulated environment, which facilitates competition in the marketplace. Without this, there will be no driver for economic growth and sustainable development will not be possible. A dynamic private sector, operating in a properly functioning competitive market system, creates jobs and income, generates wealth and helps ensure that resources are used efficiently.

In public service provision, the coordination of various actors is very crucial. Three institutions can be reformed to promote good governance: the state, the private sector and civil society. However, among various organizational cultures and the need for reform can vary depending on the priorities of that country's society. As a result, a variety of country level initiatives and international movements put emphasis on various types of governance reform (Downer, 2000).

#### 1.2 Statement of the Problem

Governance can be seen as the exercise of economic, political, and socio-administrative authority to manage a countries affairs at all levels. It comprises the mechanisms, processes and institutions, through which citizens and groups articulate their legal rights, meet their obligations and mediate their differences (IGNOU, 2009).

The public sector has an enormous impact. How can we tell whether it is doing too much or too little, whether or not it is doing the job efficiently and effectively, whether or not it serves the public? According to a traditional model of administration, it served the public through a set of hierarchical structures responsive to politicians.

A system of public institutions is an asset to a nation. If properly used, public institutions for the making of policy, implementation and administration are as important to national development as economic resources. However, good governance inapplicability poses a serious development challenge. In the political realm, it undermines democracy and social security by subverting formal functional processes. In Ethiopia, it is a growing issue but its limitation undermines social

security, state welfare, democracy building and development (African institute of management development and governance, 2008).

Here, more generally, the study provides a brief conceptual assessment of the basic characteristics, significance of good governance, role of public institutions as well as piloting a practical survey on the practice of good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service.

#### 1.3 Objective of the Study

#### 1.3.1 General Objective

The overall objective of the research is to assess good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service.

### 1.3.2 Specific Objectives

The study has the following six specific objectives within the umbrella of the general objective.

- > To assess the basic awareness and acts of public officers and civil servants on the issue of good governance;
- To investigate the practice of existing governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service;
- To analyze the real practice of the characteristics of good governance in MCS;
- ➤ To address the interests of public servants in practicing and implementing good governance in terms of service delivery;
- ➤ To promote and present the practice and understanding level of good governance in Ethiopian Civil Service;
- > To indicate possible recommendations that could help government institutions in curbing the problems of public governance inefficiencies;

#### 1.4 Significance of the Study

The study may have the following three major significances:

- Since the principles, concepts and recommendations outlined in this study can reflect good governance practice, it may be relevant to the MCS and other public institutions to take some customized adjustments of their own governance system.
- The study could also be used as a reference for students, professionals and other organizations in investigating further research about good governance.
- The research would also help for the policy formulators, the decisions of political leaders, government stakeholders and some other direct and indirect participants who are interested in the enhancement of good governance.

Furthermore, it shows the real manifestation of good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil service. This suggests some implications for management at the organizational level. As a result of all the above issues, the public administrators and civil servants particularly and the public in general will benefit from the study.

#### 1.5 Scope and Limitation of the Study

Good governance is a very wide concept. The status and practice of good governance is varied in many institutions, but for this study the assessment is made in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service. The study also focuses on the views, attitudes and perceptions of MCS permanent employees' about the practice of good governance in their institution. However, there was a difficulty of colleting some of those data due to the negligence of the participants, unwillingness to fill the questionnaire and some other factors. The other main problem is financial limitation to carry out the assessment.

Since the study is not based on complete enumeration, it may or may not represent the views, attitudes and perceptions of the remaining employees.

## 1.6 Methodology

The methodology contains research design, the data sources and methods of data collection, the sampling design and the method of data analysis.

#### 1.6.1 Research Design

To achieve the purpose of the study, quantitative methodology has been adopted. Survey method is applied to assess good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service through its permanent employees who served the public directly.

The questionnaire was prepared in Amharic and English languages. The Amharic version is used for collecting the opinions from permanent employees to get better and clear data while, the results and discussions are done in English.

#### 1.6.2 Sources and Methods of Data Collection

This study is conducted by using two data collection methods. The primary data collection method of structured open and closed ended questioner is distributed for randomly selected respondents in MCS. The target respondents are administrators and employees of the Ministry.

#### 1.6.3 Sampling Design

The assessment is made by using simple random sampling method. The target sample respondents are including only 30% of permanent employees from the total number of organizational manpower of the Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service.

The number of organizational manpower used for the percentage calculation of sample respondents is taken from the 2012/13 Ethiopian budget year annual statistical data of MCS. As a result of this, a total of 81 participants or permanent employees of the Ministry has been expected to fill the questionnaire.

### 1.6.4 Data Analysis Method

The data analysis of the study will be done after all the relevant data are collected. For each statement in the survey presented; tables, percentages and ranges (where applicable) are used for

the generation of descriptive statistics on the assessment of good governance in Ethiopian civil service.

The research outcome including the results, discussion and conclusion parts of the last two chapters of this thesis is finally presented using quantitative statistical techniques.

#### 1.7 Outline of the Study

The thesis has four chapters. The first chapter presents plan of the whole study. It contains the objectives, relevance, significance, scope and limitation, design and methodology of conducting an assessment on good governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service.

In the second chapter, various concepts about good governance are discussed from secondary data sources. It is taken as a building block of the study.

Chapter three, the chapter of results and discussions, is also considered as the crucial area of discussion. Accordingly, the real output of the study assessed is presented here.

Finally, the conclusion and recommendation parts of the thesis are presented in the fourth chapter.

#### **CHAPTER TWO**

#### 2. Literature Review

#### 2.1 Introduction

The major objective of this research is to assess good governance in MCS. As a result, this chapter discusses the concept, public sector service, public sector management, and significance of good governance. The study also attempts to explore how the meaning and mechanisms of the notion of good governance are perceived and understood in the organizational governance.

### 2.2 The Concept of Good Governance

Good governance is a concept that has recently come into regular use in political science, public administration and more particularly development management. It appears alongside such concepts and terms as democracy and civil society, popular participation, human rights and social and sustainable development. For the first time, the concept of good governance was formulated by the World Bank in 1992. It was defined as "Manner in which power is exercised in the management of a country's economic and social resources for development". Good governance was considered central to creating and sustaining an environment which fosters strong and equitable development and is an essential component of sound economic policies (IGNOU, 2009).

Within the public management discipline, it has been regarded as an aspect of new paradigm in public administration which emphasizes the role of public managers in providing high quality services that citizens value; advocates increasing managerial autonomy, particularly by reducing central agency controls; demands, measures and rewards both organizational and individual performance; recognizes the importance of providing the human and technological resources that managers require to meet their performance targets; and its receptive to competition and open minded about which public purposes should be performed by public servants as opposed to the private sector (Agere, 2000).

Depending on the context and the overriding objective sought; he added, good governance has been said at various times to encompass: full respect of human rights, the rule of law, effective participation, multi-actor partnerships, political pluralism, transparent and accountable processes and institutions, an efficient and effective public sector, legitimacy, access to knowledge, information and education, political empowerment of people, equity, sustainability, and attitudes and values that foster responsibility, solidarity and tolerance.

According to Agere, a number of important perspectives emerge from this new paradigm, which has been the focus of debate in the political arena as well as in academic institutions with the following relationships.

- The relationship between governments and the market;
- The relationship between governments and citizens;
- The relationship between governments and voluntary and private sector;
- The relationship between the elected (politicians) and appointed (civil servants);
- The relationship between local government institutions and urban and rural dwellers;
- The relationship between legislature and executive;
- The relationship between nation states and international institutions.

In analyzing these perspectives, many public management practitioners and theoreticians from academic institutions and institutions of public administrations have formulated various procedures and processes through which genuine good governance can be achieved and have identified the principles and assumptions that underpin good governance.

From the late 1980s, the debate on good governance and its requirements has provided an impetus for new approaches to public sector management reforms. Improvement in opaque government system i.e. making it transparent; control of corruption with emphasis on accountability; responsiveness to customer needs have been seen as the major aspects of good governance (Hari, 2010).

According to the World Bank (1989), good governance as the use of power in the management of country's economic and social resources for development consists of efficient public service, reliable judicial system, and accountable administration to the public. Good governance is an

indeterminate term used in development literature to describe how public institutions conduct public affairs and manage public resources in order to guarantee the realization of human rights.

#### 2.3 The Public Sector Service

Different kinds of goods and services are indispensable for maintaining, promoting and improving the quality of lives of people. Those goods and services are provided by either public or private sectors.

Public service is defined as all activities delivered by the government to fulfill those needs that society needs to go through life (Anwaruddin, 2005). Public Service delivery is defined as a set of institutional arrangements adopted by the government to provide public goods and services to its citizens.

Public services delivery has been one of the key functions of the public sector which uses civil service bureaucracies as the instrument for the delivery of services (World Development Report, 2004).

According to Anwaruddin (2005), public service can be divided into three types:

- i) Administrative services which includes various kinds of formal documents such as citizenship certificate, land certificate, driver's license, marriage or birth certificates etc;
- ii) Goods services that facilitate various needs like distribution of food and meeting daily needs or installation of telephone, water, or electricity networks; and
- iii) Facilitating services that consists of various kinds of public facilities like education, health care, post transportation etc.

Unlike the private sector where customer is much valued, public service is generally driven by inputs and compliance with rules. Public service delivery in most of the developing countries is characterized of being ineffective, cumbersome, too much procedural, costly, red taped and not transparent. Public services should be concerned with what the customer want rather than with what providers are prepared to give.

#### 2.4 Improving Public Sector Management

Improving the delivery of public services is essential to develop an effective channel of accountability between public service providers and their clients. Options for implementing this include the decentralization of the provision of public services as well as encouraging greater choice and competition through various means of incorporating the private sector and nongovernmental organizations into the field of public service provision. Good regulatory oversight is essential to insure adequate levels of quality and service provision (Economic Commission for Africa, 2005).

The report also clearly states the increased capacity, improved incentives and better functioning of public institutions are critical elements of good governance and vehicles for economic and social developments.

Within the civil service, reforms and good governance can be achieved through the strengthening of personnel management and the effectiveness of public agencies. Poor fiscal management and inadequate government personnel policies (in areas such as such as recruitment promotion and remuneration) result in a decline in the efficiency of public sector (Agere, 2000).

Public organizations are often assigned with a huge responsibility of providing basic services to the various level members of the public or community. In other words these public delivery agencies are on the supplying end. Towards that, the governments are undertaking various institutional reforms and capacity enhancement interventions on important service delivery agencies through public sector capacity building program in an overall attempt to strengthen the supply side to deliver efficient and effective public services. But in most observations, public servants have not acted as servants of people, rather as masters without any sense of accountability and transparency.

Agere emphasized that, when the capacity of the public sector to manage the economy and deliver public service is weak, the prospect for development is poor. The public sector in many developing countries has been characterized by uneven revenue collection, poor expenditure control, and management of bloated civil service, a large parastatal sector that provides poor returns on the scarce public funds invested in it, and weaknesses in the capacity of core economic agencies to design and implement policies that would address problems.

Improving delivery of public services means redressing the imbalances of services to all levels of society; enhancing welfare, equity and efficiency, etc. It also means a complete change in the way that services are delivered. A shift away from inward-looking, bureaucratic systems, processes and attitudes, towards new ways of working which put the needs of the public first, is better, faster and more responsive to meet those needs.

In improving the public sector management; in most African countries, the capacity of public sector institutions and the delivery of public services deteriorated as economies stagnated or went into decline from the early 1970's. The structural adjustment programs of the 1980's and 1990's were accompanied by attempts to improve public sector performance, but there is widespread consensus that these attempts leaving little government capacity after the drastic downsizing during the early years of adjustment (Economic Commission for Africa, 2005).

In Ethiopia, several initiatives have been implemented to improve relationships between citizens and administration as well as the quality of service delivery mechanism. The reform in developed countries known as public/civil service reform has become a global wide trend with many public sector organizations. As a result, Ethiopia also has introduced some reform ideas related to the CSR model for making the public sector more effective and result oriented. The Balanced Scored Card (BSC) is one of such tools with the primary purpose of improving the quality of service being offered to the citizen and to ensure better citizen satisfaction. It was introduced officially with the then ministry of capacity building in May/2010 by ordering all the ministries to develop their BSC tools and to try to carry out their activities accordingly (Ethiopian Management Institute, 2012).

To this effect, the BSC training manual designed by the Ethiopian Ministry of Capacity Building, has been the following purposes.

- i) Providing organizational mission and vision centered integration between the employees;
- ii) Connecting the annual plan and strategic plan by building strategic conceptualization
- iii) Helps to increase mission driven leaders
- iv) Realizes organizational learning by integrating pay scale with result and result with performance behavior;

- v) Helps to create best performer group and institution;
- vi) Creates transparency, ownership and accountability as a system.

#### 2.5 Characteristics of Good Governance

Good Governance relates to enhancing the quality of governance through empowerment participation, accountability and justice. Researchers, policy makers and international institutions have attempted to conceptualize the concept of governance and identify its basic characteristics (IGNOU, 2009).

The international fund for agricultural development (1999), states that the UNDP has classified eight major characteristics of good governance. As a result, good governance is Participatory, Follows the rule of low, Transparent, Responsive, Consensus Oriented, Equitable and Inclusive, Effective and Efficient, Accountable.

#### A. Participation

Participation by both men and women is a key cornerstone of good governance. It could be either direct or through legitimate intermediate institutions or representatives. It is important to point out that representative democracy does not necessarily mean that the concerns of the most vulnerable in society would be taken into consideration in decision making (Upadhyay, 2006).

Governments aiming to insure the requisite freedom to the citizens in order to participate in the decision making processes articulate and represent their interests, which get reflected in policies and programs (IGNOU, 2009).

Participation has a wide range of definitions. On the one side, some researchers take participation to mean simply engaging with any particular activity (Waheduzzaman, 2010); on the other side, researchers define participation as a process through which people influence and share control over development initiatives (World Bank, 1996).

#### B. Rule of Law

Good governance requires fair legal frameworks that are enforced impartially, i.e. it does not imply arbitrary use of authority. It also requires full protection of human rights, particularly those

of minorities. This should be supported by appropriate enforcement machinery of laws requires an independent judiciary and an impartial and incorruptible police force which instills confidence in the people (IGNOU, 2009).

A pro governance and pro development legal and judicial system is one in which the laws are clear and are uniformly applied through an objective and independent judiciary. It is also one in which the legal system provides the necessary sanctions to penalize breach. It promotes respect for human rights and private capital flows (African development Bank, 2000).

#### C. Transparency

Transparency means that decisions taken and their enforcement are done in a manner that follows rules and regulations. It also means that information is freely available and directly accessible to those who will be affected by such decisions (IGNOU, 2009) and their enforcement. It also means that enough information is provided and that it is provided in easily understandable forms and media.

Transparency is broadly defined as public knowledge of the policies of government and confidence in its intentions. This requires making public accounts verifiable, providing for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens. It also includes making available for public scrutiny accurate and timely information on economic and market conditions (Agere, 2000).

Transparency requires that governments not only do not impede the flow of information to the public, but also an active involvement on their part to make the necessary provisions to ensure that public information can have a feedback effect on governmental performance. It can thus strengthen the legitimacy of government (UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 2007).

#### **D.** Responsiveness

Responsibility refers to the public servant's responsiveness to the public, by methods and procedures to enforce the public will. Good governance requires that institutions and processes try to serve all stakeholders within a reasonable timeframe (Obaidullah, 2001).

Responsiveness as the capacity to satisfy the preferences of citizen's especially those who are dependent upon the institution. In simple language, bureaucratic responsiveness means responding to public community needs and demands. Being responsive to citizen's need and concerns is the key to effective and efficient service delivery. Traditionally officials were less responsive to citizens and there were more discretion (Hari, 2010).

#### E. Consensus Oriented

There are several actors and as many view points in a given society. Good governance requires mediation of the different interests in society to reach a broad consensus in society on what is in the best interest of the whole community and how this can be achieved. It also requires a broad and long-term perspective on what is needed for sustainable human development and how to achieve the goals of such development. This can only result from an understanding of the historical, cultural and social contexts of a given society or community (Upadhyay, 2006).

#### F. Equity and Inclusiveness

Since governance structures and mechanisms aim at participation, they have to promote equity. A society's well being depends on ensuring that all its members feel that they have a stake in it and do not feel excluded from the mainstream of society. This requires all groups, but particularly the most vulnerable, have opportunities to improve or maintain their well being (IGNOU, 2009).

#### G. Effectiveness and Efficiency

The International fund for Agricultural Development (1999), states efficiency and effectiveness as the process and institutions produce results that meet the needs of society, while making the best use of resources at their disposal.

On the other hand, UN (2007) has expressed efficiency as "the extent to which government is fostering an economically efficient system of production and distribution, reducing uncertainty. It is the allocation of public spending managing the economy and implement its' policies in a stable and predictable manner."

#### H. Accountability

Accountability is a key requirement of good governance. An organization or an institution is accountable to those who will be affected by its decisions or actions. Accountability cannot be enforced without transparency and the rule of law.

The concept of accountability refers to the legal and reporting framework, organizational structure, strategy, procedures and actions (The International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions, n.d).

The concept of accountability has meant different things to different people at deferent times. In the perspective of traditional definitions, it means a faithful compliance to written rules, procedures and established conventions. Under the traditional concept of accountability, the members of bureaucracy are accountable to the chain of command rather than to the people or beneficiaries of the program. Accountability today, in the real sense, should be for the implementation of the policies and the attainment of the assigned task. It is needless to mention here that the goals must be spelt out targets and milestones must be fixed, functions must be assigned, the needed decision making power must be delegated, and performance must be periodically monitored. The strength of accountability in a program or system is expressed by its efficiency and effectiveness, which in turn may be measured by the extent and quality accrued by the target beneficiaries. The term accountability should not be confused with the term responsibility (Obaidullah, 2001).

Accountability is defined as holding responsible elected or appointed individuals and organizations charged with a public mandate to account for specific actions, activities or decisions to the public from whom they drive their authority. In a narrow sense, accountability focuses on the ability to account for the allocation use and control, i.e. budgeting, accounting and auditing. In a broader sense, it is also concerned with the establishment and enforcement of rules and regulations of corporate governance (Agere, 2000).

#### **Principles of Organizational Governance**

The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (2004), identifies six principles of good governance. Each principle contributes the most valuable ideas to build the organizational

governance system. All has a direct link to the engagement of stakeholders in making accountability real.

# A. Focusing on the Organization's Purpose and on Outcomes for Citizens and Service Users

The function of governance is to ensure that an organization or partnership fulfill to its overall purpose, achieves its intended outcomes for citizens and service users, and operates in an effective, efficient and ethical manner. This principle should guide all governance activity. Each organization has its own purpose. There are also some general purposes that are fundamental to all public governance, including providing good quality services and achieving value for money.

Having a clear organizational purpose and set of objectives is a hallmark of good governance. If this purpose is communicated effectively, it can guide people's actions and decisions at all levels in an organization. For many organizations, others (in particular, central governments) play a major role in determining policy and resources and in setting or agreeing objectives. In these circumstances, it is critically important that there is a common view of the organization's purposes and its intended outcomes.

All public service organizations provide a service to other people and/or organizations, although not all provide services directly to members of the public. The quality of service is an important measure of how effective an organization is, and so it is particularly important in governance. Users of public services, unlike consumers in the private sector, usually have little or no option to go elsewhere for services or to withdraw payment. Providers of public services have fewer direct financial incentives than private companies to improve consumer satisfaction. Organizations that provide public services therefore need to take additional steps to ensure that services are of a high quality.

All organizations that spend public money either in commissioning services or providing them directly have a duty to strive for economy, efficiency and effectiveness in their work. Citizens and taxpayers have an important and legitimate interest in the value for money provided by organizations that use public money.

#### B. Performing Effectively in Clearly Defined Functions and Roles

Good governance requires all concerned to be clear about the functions of governance and their own roles and responsibilities and those of others, and to behave in ways that are consistent with those roles. Being clear about one's own role, and how it relates to that of others, increases the chance of performing the role well. Clarity about roles also helps all stakeholders to understand how the governance system works and who is accountable for what.

Governors and governing bodies need to be clear about the nature of their relationship with the public. The governing body's role is to direct and control the organization in the public interest and to ensure accountability to the public. Being clear about this increases the chances that governors and others will understand governors' responsibilities to the public and be aware of the limitations of what they can be expected to do.

# C. Promoting Values for the Whole Organization and Demonstrating the Values of Good Governance through Behavior

Good governance flows from a shared ethos or culture, as well as from systems and structures. It cannot be reduced to a set of rules, or achieved fully by compliance with a set of requirements. This spirit or ethos of good governance can be expressed as values and demonstrated in behavior. It builds on the seven principles for the conduct of people in public life as: selflessness, integrity, objectivity, accountability, openness, honesty and leadership. A hallmark of good governance is the development of shared values, which become part of the organization's culture, underpinning policy and behavior throughout the organization, from the governing body to all staff.

Individual behavior is a major factor in the effectiveness of the governing body, and also has an influence on the reputation of the organization, the confidence and trust members of the public have in it and the working relationships and morale within it. Conflicts, real or perceived, can arise between the organization's interests and those of individual governors. Public trust can then be damaged unless the organization implements clear procedures to deal with these conflicts.

#### D. Taking Informed, Transparent Decisions and Managing Risk

Decision making in governance is complex and challenging. It must further the organization's purpose and strategic direction and be robust in the medium and longer terms. To make such

decisions, governors must be well informed. Governors making decisions need the support of appropriate systems, to help to ensure that decisions are implemented and that resources are used legally and efficiently. A governing body may, for example, adopt the discipline of formally reviewing implementation of a new policy after a defined initial period, to see whether it is working as intended.

Different types of organization have different statutory requirements for the publication of their decisions. Over and above these requirements, transparent decisions that are clearly explained are more likely to be understood by staff, the public and other stakeholders and to be implemented effectively. It is also easier to evaluate the impact of decisions that are transparent, and therefore to have evidence on which to draw in making future decisions.

A hallmark of good governance is a clearly defined level of delegation by the governing body to the executive for decision making. The governing body sets policies as parameters within which the executive works on behalf of the governing body. For this to work well, it is important that governors do not concern themselves with levels of detail that are inappropriate for their role, while ensuring that they are not too far removed to provide effective oversight and scrutiny. Conflicts can arise between the personal interests of individuals involved in making decisions and decisions that the governing body needs to make in the public interest. To ensure probity and to avoid public concern or loss of confidence, governing bodies have to take steps to avoid any such conflicts of interest, whether real or perceived.

Good quality information and clear objective advice can significantly reduce the risk of taking decisions that fail to achieve their objectives or have serious unintended consequences. Governors need to receive rigorous analyses of comprehensive background information and evidence, and of the options for action. As governance decisions are complex and can have significant consequences, governors also need professional advice.

Public service organizations face a wide range of strategic, operational and financial risks, from both internal and external factors, which may prevent them from achieving their objectives. Risk management is a planned and systematic approach to identifying, evaluating and responding to risks and providing assurance that responses are effective.

A risk management system also supports the annual statement on internal control that many public service organizations now have to produce. Appropriate responses to risk will include implementing internal controls, insuring against the risk, terminating the activity that is causing the risk, modifying the risk or, in some circumstances, accepting the risk.

#### E. Developing the Capacity and Capability of the Governing Body to be Effective

Public service organizations need people with the right skills to direct and control them effectively. Governing bodies should consider the skills that they need for their particular situation. To increase their chances of finding these people and to enrich governance deliberations by bringing together a group of people with different backgrounds, governing bodies need to recruit governors from different parts of society. Public trust and confidence in governance will increase if governance is not only done well, but is done by a diverse group of people who reflect the community.

Governance is also likely to be more effective and dynamic if new people with new ideas are appointed regularly, but this needs to be balanced with the need for stability to provide continuity of knowledge and relationships.

Governance roles and responsibilities are challenging and demanding, and governors need the right skills for their roles. In addition, governance is strengthened by the participation of people with many different types of knowledge and experience. Good governance means drawing on the largest possible pool of potential governors to recruit people with the necessary skills. Encouraging a wide range of people to apply for appointed positions or to stand for election will develop a membership that has a greater range of experience and knowledge. It will also help to increase the diversity of governors in terms of age, ethnic background, social class and life experiences, gender and disability. Paying governors for their time may make participation in governance a practical option for more people and encourage a wider range of people to take part; it can also be a way of publicly recognizing the seriousness of governance responsibilities.

Governors need both skills and knowledge to do their jobs well. Skills need to be developed continually to improve performance in the functions of the governing body. The necessary skills include the ability to scrutinize and challenge information received from the executive, including skills in financial management and the ability to recognize when outside expert advice is needed. Knowledge also needs to be updated regularly to equip governors for changing circumstances. An appraisal and performance review of individual governors demonstrates that their role and

contribution is important and valued and provides an opportunity for them to take stock of their own development needs. The governing body can improve its collective performance by taking the time to step back and consider its own effectiveness.

#### F. Engaging Stakeholders and Making Accountability Real

Governing bodies of public services have multiple accountabilities: to the public and to those who have the authority, and responsibility, to hold them to account on the public's behalf. These include: commissioners of services, Parliament, ministers, government departments and regulators.

Real accountability requires a relationship and a dialogue. The Public Services accountability involves an agreed process for both giving an account of your actions and being held to account; a systematic approach to put that process into operation; and a focus on explicit results or outcomes. Real accountability is concerned not only with reporting on or discussing actions already completed, but also with engaging with stakeholders to understand and respond to their views as the organization plans and carries out its activities.

Staff is accountable to the governing body, but the governing body also has serious responsibilities, as an employer, to the staff. Recruiting, motivating and keeping staff are vital issues if public services are to be effective. The governing body needs to provide an environment in which staff can perform well and deliver effective services, by creating a culture that welcomes ideas and suggestions, responds to staff views and explains decisions. The governing body is itself the last point of appeal for staff with complaints or concerns that they have not been able to deal with through the organization's management structures.

Institutional stakeholders are other organizations with which the organization needs to work for formal accountability or to improve services and outcomes. Public services have a complex network of governance relationships involving lateral relationships between partners and hierarchical relationships between Parliament, central government and local organizations. Some of these are accountability relationships, while others are to do with working together to achieve better outcomes.

#### 2.6 Role of the Civil Service Institutions

As in all developing countries, development remains the priority of priorities in state policy, and the work of all government ministries is to support the country's development efforts. The human capital capacity building strategy supports reform in those institutions that promotes capacity building in areas such as human geography, education, health, housing, equality, personal satisfaction, etc. There is a direct connection between capacity building (human development) in a structural context and human capital development (Davis, 2011).

Since these are to be undertaken and carried out by civil servants, it is the civil service institutions that bear the heavy burden of making sure that these individuals have what it takes to accomplish their assigned tasks. Are they committed to development? Do they have the values needed to reinforce this commitment and the work ethic necessary for this important undertaking? Do they have the appropriate knowledge and skills required for satisfactory performance in their functions (Ntalaja, 2011)?

Ntalaja added, these and related questions are indispensable for understanding the position and role of the civil service institutions in the implementation of best governance practices for development. While the civil service ministry is the key agency for the training and discipline needed to achieve this goal, the role of other state institutions is indispensable in the context of the fight against both poverty and corruption.

#### 2.6.1 Citizen Charter Statements

Public institutions have to identify their way of delivering the expected services to the public in general in an efficient and effective manner.

In a rapidly changing context where efficiency, effectiveness and competence of state institutions are being questioned, it is imperative for the state agencies to strive for improvement in performance. With the globalization of new techniques of administrative reforms, NPM and good governance agendas have been spread all over the world. CC is one of such techniques with the primary purpose of improving the quality of service being offered to the citizen and to ensure better citizen satisfaction (Tamrakar, 2010).

These citizen charters are statements that provide information to the general public about the nature of services being provided by an organization, procedures, costs involved, mechanisms

for lodging complaints in case the citizens are not satisfied, time taken for their redress, and so on (IGNOU, 2009).

#### A. Principles of Citizen Charter

The objective of charter exercise is to build bridges between citizens and administration and to streamline administration in tune with the needs of citizens. Tamrakar, (2010) has listed down the following major principles of CC.

- **Standards**: Setting, monitoring and publication of explicit standards for the services that individual users can reasonably expect.
- **Information and openness**: Full, accurate information, readily available in plain language.
- Choice and consultation: The public sector should provide choice wherever practicable.
   There should be regular and systematic consultation with those who use services.
- Courtesy and helpfulness: Services available equally to all who are entitled to them and run to suit their convenience.
- Putting things right (Correction of errors): If things go wrong, an apology, a full explanation, and a swift and effective remedy to be offered.
- Value for money (Financial value): Efficient and economical delivery of public services
  within the resources, the nation can afford and independent validation of performance
  against standards.

#### 2.6.2 Civil Service Reform

Civil service refers to the body of government officials who are employed in civil occupations that are neither political nor judicial (Satish, 2004).

As the administrative arm of the state, the civil service is extremely important for both its functioning and its image. Both the image and the functioning of the state have suffered tremendously due to the declining capacity of the state to perform its traditional functions in an effective way. Although state decline, collapse or failure is a function of factors other than the behavior of civil servants, they are the most visible representatives of the state and easy targets

for popular anger and blame. Some of this blame or anger has been earned by civil servants for the arrogant, selfish and inconsiderate manner in which they dealt with the public for purposes of making ends meet (Ntalaja, 2011).

With respect to the development tasks of the state, the reform of the civil service is necessary not only to rid public administration of its deadwood, the incompetent and the corrupt, but also to train those retained in the service so they can acquire new skills and new approaches in their respective areas of work. A major part of this training must deal with inculcating democratic values, including the respect due to citizens as stakeholders with rights and privileges, and not people to be subjected to humiliation, harassment, extortion, and any kind of brutal treatment. For it is only when such values become part of their daily working equipment that civil servants can play a major role in the development process.

A well-functioning civil service helps to foster good policymaking, effective service delivery, accountability and responsibility in utilizing public resources which are the characteristics of good governance. Good Governance is being used as an all-inclusive framework not only for administrative and civil service reform, but as a link between Civil Service Reform and an all-embracing framework for making policy decisions effective within viable systems of accountability and citizen participation. Administrative reform focuses on rationalizing structures of government. Governance reform tends to refer to the improvement of legal and policy frameworks to create proper decision making environment; participatory systems for elements of civil society to become actively involved in policy and program formulation and their implementation; and an effective and transparent system and process for control and accountability in government activities. Civil Services reform cannot be seen in isolation and it has to be undertaken along with administrative reforms for effective results (Ntalaja, 2011).

As the administrative arm of the state, the civil service is extremely important for both its functioning and its image. Both the image and the functioning of the state have suffered tremendously due to the declining capacity of the state to perform its traditional functions in an effective way. Although state decline, collapse or failure is a function of factors other than the behavior of civil servants, they are the most visible representatives of the state and easy targets for popular anger and blame. Some of this blame or anger has been earned by civil servants for the arrogant, selfish and inconsiderate manner in which they dealt with the public for purposes of

making ends meet. Poorly and in some cases irregularly paid, civil servants have invented a multitude of ways in which they can rip off the public in order to maximize their income.

Public sector reforms was initiated against the background that the government required a departure from its old traditional method of running administration and the urgent need for a renewed public sector to propel government in its quest for sustainable socio- economic, political, and technological developments. So, there is a need for structural re-engineering of the public sector with the infusion of new spirits, values, professionalism, accountability, responsiveness, and focused sense of the mission for maximum efficiency of the economy (Omoyefa, 2008).

# 2.6.3 Promoting a Culture of Good Governance through Values and Outcome Based Ethics

The concept of ethics has been a late comer in the realm of public administration. For too long, doing one's duty well was considered to an equivalent of bureaucratic ethics. Ethics refers to an idealistic dimension in the normative system which emphasizes the quality of life. It further refers to the normative standards of behavior of public officials and that emanates from the philosophical and religious traditions of a particular community. Often, it is interpreted as the correct moral behavior which implies that the prescribed rules are followed.

A public agency's traditional ideals, norms and values must change if it is to inculcate a performance oriented organizational culture that supports managerial values and attitudes; encourages behaviors that are performance related; emphasizes quality service, adaptability, creativity, initiative, cohesion, and team work; gives employees leeway to make mistakes, but requires that they learn from them; recognizes the diversity of commitments and affiliations that civil servants have; acknowledges that individual behaviors will differ according to individual beliefs about public service, risk performance, attitude to change and tolerance of ambiguity and indeterminacy (Agere, 2000).

Those people could be permanent staff casuals or volunteers in their status but they are at the heart of the organization that joins the entity with their own capacities, ambitions and drives. Thus, in the public organization with such varying backgrounds come to share an organization culture often founded on the way they look at the world, the way they solve internal and external

problems, the way they handle internal and external challenges and the way they serve their customers or deliver services. Furthermore they have to have shared values on issues like time, leadership, formality and intimacy while undertaking their duties.

Most of the focus on administrative morality is on the aspect of probity within the administrative system, there is a need to consider the issue of the responsibility of the governance system (of which administrative system is an integral part) to create and sustain an ethical ambiance in the socio-economic system that would nurture and protect the basic moral values (IGNOU, 2009).

#### A. Leadership

Members of governing bodies of public sector entities need to exercise leadership by conducting themselves in accordance with high standards of behavior, as a role model for others within the entity. Governing bodies of public sector entities are usually responsible for determining those values and standards that will serve to define the culture of the entity and govern the behavior of everyone within it. High standards of behavior need to be demanded of all public servants. Governing body members have a special responsibility to exemplify the standards that they expect others within the organization to meet. This reinforces the need for appropriate human resource policies, including recruitment procedures, followed by induction and ongoing awareness training to ensure governing body members have a proper understanding of their responsibilities and the standards of behavior expected of them (International Federation of Accountants, 2001).

Support for leadership development and managing change cuts across governance efforts. Effective leadership, essential for good governance program is particularly important when countries are undergoing complex or systemic change involving civil society and private sectors. Effective leadership entails developing the capacities of everyone who can increase political and administrative commitment to sustainable human development (Agere, 2000).

At the same time Sam Agere mentions some requirements for successful leadership implementation of managerial reform as redefining organizational primary purpose and core beliefs; creating a vision of how the post reform future will look in terms of organizational structure, culture and performance standard; defining the required strategic objectives with in a

medium to long term perspective; planning and resourcing adequately the necessary structural and procedural changes; and empowering those expected to assume group leadership positions.

#### **B.** Codes of Conduct

Governing bodies of public sector entities need to adopt a formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity are required to subscribe.

An ethical code reflects the ideals of sincerity, faithfulness, promise keeping, quest for excellence, fairness, empathy, decency, accountability and consideration for others. In other words, a code of ethics depicts a standard of integrity and competence beyond that required by low. According to Hanecom and Thornhill (1987), code of ethics in an organization would have the following four main objectives (Ararso, 2007):

- The encouragement and preservation of responsible behavior by public servants and officials;
- The promotion of confidence in the honesty of public servants and officials;
- The provision of direction to public servants and officials, supervisors and the public; as well as,
- The provision of direction to public officials in regard to the exercising of their discretionary powers.

As major contributory actors, the public in general and its institutions are expected to promote those ethical practices and values. In its imperative for public servants and officials to adhere to the stipulations of an ethical code otherwise justice will deteriorate, personal interest will displace local interest, indecision and aversion will increase, the foundation for faithfulness will dwindle, and the disorder will degenerate into anarchy.

#### C. Organizational Structures and Processes

Most public sector entities are established for specific purposes and have limited authority to incur expenditure only for identified purposes. Many institutions also have statutory

responsibilities to deliver, either directly or indirectly, services to citizens. The purpose, authority and responsibilities of many public sector entities are usually set out in enabling or other legislation. Public sector entities therefore, need to establish appropriate mechanisms to ensure that they do not exceed their powers or functions, and that they comply with any obligations imposed upon them, whether defined in statute or otherwise.

Governing bodies of public sector entities need to establish effective organizational structures and processes to ensure:

- Their statutory accountability is properly discharged to the individual(s) or entity responsible for electing or appointing the governing body and appraising its performance, and for providing the entity with assets and resources;
- Proper accountability for public money;
- Clear communication with stakeholders; and Clarity about roles and responsibilities of top
  management and in particular the relative roles and responsibilities of non-executive
  members of the governing body and executive management (The International Federation
  of Accountants, 2001).

Accordingly, governing bodies of public sector entities need to give a senior executive specific responsibility for ensuring that appropriate advice is given to the governing body on compliance with applicable statutes and regulations, and other relevant statements of best practice. In addition, governing bodies of public sector entities need to set in place mechanisms to take anticipatory action as well as post-event action, to prevent the occurrence of possible breaches of the law.

Public sector entities need to establish effective arrangements to ensure compliance with all applicable statutes, regulations and other relevant statements of best practice. Public servants need to uphold the reputation of the entity by treating the general public and people from other organizations:

- In a helpful, honest and courteous manner;
- On a timely, reliable and, where appropriate, confidential basis;

- In an open, fair and efficient way;
- With due consideration for others' health, safety and personal welfare; and
- By avoiding harassment, discrimination or abuse of any kind.

For their part, governing body members have a responsibility towards their staff. The governing body needs to seek to establish an open climate and culture in which staff can have confidence in the fairness and impartiality of procedures for registering and dealing with their interests and concerns. Similarly, it is the responsibility of governing body members and senior executive management to ensure equality of opportunity and to establish open and fair procedures for making appointments and for determining terms and conditions of service (The International Federation of Accountants, 2001).

#### **2.6.4** Implementation of Performance Measures

The public sector is under intense pressure to improve its operations and deliver its products and services more efficiently and at the least cost to the taxpayer. Performance measurement is a useful tool in this regard, since it formalizes the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions. Thus, performance measurement can help improve the quality and reduce cost of government activities (Ibid).

To improve performance, it is also necessary to measure performance in non-monetary terms. Without information about what is being delivered (outputs), what it is costing (inputs), and what is achieved (outcomes) it is impossible to make efficient resource allocations within the public sector. The objectives of performance measures include responding to accountability requirements, improving service delivery, and reducing costs while maximizing output and increasing productivity in the entity.

Performance measures are therefore useful management and accountability tools. They are needed by both internal and external users. Internal users need information on the entity's effectiveness to make efficiency and quality improvements. Government entities may require performance information to decide how much to spend and where within the sector the spending should be allocated. In particular they will be interested to know what results may be achieved as

a consequence of a particular level of funding, or to decide whether or not a service could be delivered more efficiently and effectively by the private sector (The International Federation of Accountants, 2001).

#### 2.7 Significance of Good Governance in the Public Sector

Good governance comes with establishing a sustainable administrative structure, which can effectively achieve excellence by employing minimum administrative heads supported by a strong human resource capital.

Good governance aims at achieving much more than efficient management of economic and financial resources or public services. It is a broad reform strategy to make government more open responsive accountable democratic as well as strengthens institutions of civil society and regulate private sector. It is a combination of efficiency concerns of public management and accountability concerns of governance (IGNOU, 2009).

As Sam Agere states in his book of promoting good governance, weaknesses in public administration result in a decline in the probity of public servants and inadequate legislative oversight of the government. Further, corruption erodes the authority and effectiveness public institutions. Improvements, therefore, in the effectiveness and transparency of economic policies and administrative reform can contribute powerfully to fight against corruption. Good governance, hence, relates to the quality of governance through attributes such as participation, empowerment, accountability, equity and justice.

Based on the UN Public Governance Indicators (2007), quality of governance related to Per capita income is strongly and positively correlated across countries. According to this document, three complementary possibilities work their way into this correlation. One possibility is that better governance exerts a powerful effect on income. A second possibility is that improvements in governance are the result of a higher income. Yet, a third possibility is that there are other factors that interplay to make countries richer and better governed.

Good governance is an essential precondition for development. Various countries those are quite similar in terms of their natural resources and social structures have shown strikingly different performance in improving the welfare of their people. Much of this is attributable to standards of governance. Poor governance stifles and impedes development. In those countries where there

are corruptions, poor control of public funds, lack of accountability, abuses of human rights and excessive military influence development inevitably suffers (The Australian Government's Overseas Aid Program, 2000).

Good governance is used as both as a means and an end in itself. It becomes an end if it addresses all its major elements satisfactorily. This implies that society is generally satisfied with the procedures and processes of arriving at solutions to problems, even they may not necessarily agree on the methods and conclusions. It is therefore the highest state of development and management of a nation's affairs. It is good that a democratic form of government is in place that people participate in decision-making processes, that services are delivered efficiently, that human rights are respected, and that the government is transparent, accountable and productive (Agere, 2000).

The concept can also be regarded as a means to an end in that, in general, it contributes to economic growth, human development and social justice. Good governance as a concept will be used in this context of the public service reform or new public management paradigm. With in administrative reform it is used as a means of addressing other contemporary issues such as institutional development, capacity building, decentralization of power and authority, relations between politicians and appointed officials, coordination and the roles that the heads of government play in promoting good governance (Agere, 2000).

With good governance in public institutions, accountability is insured, citizens' quality of life can be improved, effectiveness and efficiency of administration can be enhanced, legitimacy and credibility of institutions could be established, freedom of information and expression can be secured, the provision of citizen friendly and citizen caring administration is maximized and promotion of organizational pluralism can be guaranteed.

#### **CHAPTER THREE**

#### 3. Results and Discussions

This chapter deals with the results and discussions of the findings. As a result, the first part of this chapter presents the organizations profile, whereas the second and third parts deal with the general characteristics of the population and the analysis and interpretation of the data respectively.

In order to assess the views of employees toward the good governance practice of the organization, questionnaires were distributed to 81 permanent staff employees who are currently working in the MCS.

#### 3.1 Organizational Profile

The Ministry of Civil Service is an autonomous organ of the federal government. The law establishing the institution assigned multiple responsibilities to it and requires it to play a pivotal role in promoting good governance by insuring the establishment of competent and effective civil service; insuring merit based recruitment and selection of the federal civil servants; adopting strategies for the sustainable development and use of human resources in the civil service and follow up the implementation; insuring the establishment of competence and performance related pay and reward system and some other duties and responsibilities that the low has provided the most important provisions that define its structure, autonomy, powers and duties.

Modern public administration in Ethiopia was started in turn of the first decade of the 20th century during the time of Emperior Minilik II. The Emperor appointed nine Ministers marking the beginning of modern administration in the Ethiopian history. But the state functions were not fulfilled due to the absence of practical rules and regulations pertinent to government bureaucracies.

Towards improving the state of affairs in state functions and public services a government institution known as Central Personnel Agency /CPA/ was established with duties and rights by order no. 23 of 1961 to promote centralization and apply rules and regulations in providing public services.

During the military regime its name was changed to Public Service Commission /PSC/ with a new organizational structure. After the downfall of the Military regime in 1991, the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) re-established the Federal Civil Service Commission /FCSC/ by proclamation no. 8/1995. Meanwhile it was found essential to redefine the organization, powers and duties of the executive organs of the FDRE; hence the merger of the ministry of Capacity Building and the Federal Civil Service Agency (now Ministry of Civil Service) was decreed by proclamation no. 691/2010 (Ministry of Civil Service Bulletin, n.d).

#### 3.2 Data Presentation and Analysis

In order to assess the views, attitudes and perceptions of employees towards good governance practice of their organization; questionnaire were developed and distributed to 81 permanent service providers who are currently working in MCS. But the returned questionnaires were only 76 (94%).

Tables and percentages are applied to present the assessment. For the purpose of simplicity, the total numbers of filled and returned 76 (94%) questionnaires are taken as 100% respondents for the real calculation of the data in each table. The percentage values in each table are approximated to the nearest approximate possible zero decimal place.

#### 3.2.1 Respondent by Gender and Work Position

Unintentionally, almost equal ratios of male and female were randomly given the chance to fill the questionnaire. This balance in sex ratio is 1:1.

On the other hand, the table 3.1 below indicates that 10 (12%) respondents hold the work position of departmental heads and the remaining 66 (82%) are experts and other workers in the organization.

Table 3.1 Bio data of MCS Respondents'

|             |      |        | Work 1       | position |                               |     |      |        | Serv   | vice y      | ear in | No. of | Sample |
|-------------|------|--------|--------------|----------|-------------------------------|-----|------|--------|--------|-------------|--------|--------|--------|
| Data type   | Male | Female | in           | the      | Educational status government |     |      | nent   | respon | respondents |        |        |        |
|             |      |        | organization |          |                               |     | org  | ganiza | ation  | dents       |        |        |        |
|             |      |        | Heads        | Expert   | M.A                           | B.A | Dip  | Others | <10    | >11         | >20    |        |        |
|             |      |        |              | and      |                               |     | loma |        |        | and         |        |        |        |
|             |      |        |              | others   |                               |     |      |        |        | <20         |        |        |        |
| No of       | 38   | 38     | 10           | 66       | 2                             | 44  | 22   | 8      | 28     | 14          | 34     | 76     | 81     |
| respondents |      |        |              |          |                               |     |      |        |        |             |        |        |        |
| %           | 50   | 50     | 13           | 87       | 3                             | 58  | 29   | 11     | 37     | 18          | 45     | 100    | 100    |

#### 3.2.2 Respondents by Educational Status and Service Year

In the table 3.1 above, the educational status were categorized in to four parts as respondents holding Master of Arts Degree, Bachelor of Arts Degree, Diploma and others having the education and training at high school and certificate level. As a result, from those employees filling the questionnaire, only 2 (3%) are having M.A, the majority of the respondents i.e. 44 (58%) having B.A, 22 (29%) having Diploma and 8 (11%) are holding lower level to certificate educational status.

The service year is categorized in three main segments for the purpose of simplicity. Amazingly, in the data above there are some employees served around 33 years in government organizations. According to the first category, there are 28 (37%) who are served the public for about ten years. Whereas, the remaining 48 (63%) respondents has been served in the public sector for many years.

#### 3.2.3 MCS's Employee Conceptual Assessment about Good Governance

Four statements about good governance have been presented for the MCS permanent employees. The table 3.2 below shows distribution of opinions about the conceptual assessment on good governance in the Ministry.

Table 3.2 MCS Employees' Conceptual Assessment on Good Governance

|   |          | Participants | response |         |
|---|----------|--------------|----------|---------|
| Description of statements                   | Strongly | Partly       | Disagree | Don't   |
|   | Agree    | Agree        |          | know    |
| Many employees know about Good              | 24(32%)  | 30(39%)      | 10(13%)  | 12(16%) |
| Governance.                                 |          |              |          |         |
| Language used in Good Governance is easy to | 42(55%)  | 24(32%)      | 6(8%)    | 4(5%)   |
| read and understand.                        |          |              |          |         |
| The necessary trainings related to good     | 20(26%)  | 24(32%)      | 28(37%)  | 4(5%)   |
| governance are given for employees.         |          |              |          |         |
| Good governance is important in public      | 76(100%) | 0(0%)        | 0(0%)    | 0(0%)   |
| service delivery.                           |          |              |          |         |

In the table 3.2 above about the conceptual assessment of good governance in Ministry of Civil Service indicates that majority of the employees know about good governance. But 10 (13%) of the respondents disagree on the statement explaining many employees know about good governance and 12 (16%) from the total respondents do not know about the knowledge that many employees have about good governance. Only 24 (32%) are strongly agreed that the statement is acceptable.

Also, 42 (55%) respondents have agreed on the language used in good governance is easy to read and understand. Few of them have responded that they do not know whether the language is easy to read and understand or not. Though, there are 6 (8%) disagree, 24 (32%) respondents that give their opinion as partially disagree on the idea.

It is pertinent that, good governance would come with the continuous trainings given starting from the lower level workers to the higher officials. In this case, only 20 (26%) of the respondents are strongly agreed and the other 24 (32%) partly disagree on the statement related to the training activities given about good governance for the employees. The remaining 32 (42%) also disagree and even don't know whether the same trainings are given or not.

Surprisingly, though there is a deference of opinions on other statements, all respondents have strongly agreed on the importance of good governance in public service delivery.

#### 3.2.4 Assessment of the Practice of Good Governance in MCS

To know the perception of those employees about the existence of good governance in the ministry only one statement was given for those respondents. The table 3.3 below shows how much the employees perceive the presence of good governance in their organization.

Table 3.3 Employees' Perception on the Practice of Good Governance

|   |          | Participan | ts response |         |
|---|----------|------------|-------------|---------|
| Description of statements                 | Strongly | Partly     | Disagree    | Don't   |
|   | Agree    | Agree      |             | know    |
| Many employees believing the existence of | 8(11%)   | 20(26%)    | 30(39%)     | 18(24%) |
| good governance in the organization.      |          |            |             |         |

There is a minimum existence of good governance in the organization. I.e. only 8 (11%) respondents strongly agree on the statement and 26% are partly agreed. On the other hand, the majority (39%) and (24%) of the respondents have an opinion of many employees does not believe and do not know the existence of good governance.

#### 3.2.5 MCS's Service Delivery for the Public

Public service organizations provide a service to other people and organizations, although not all provide services directly to members of the public. The quality of service is an important measure of how effective an organization is, and so it is particularly important in governance. As a result of this, the table 3.4 below summarizes the ideas of the MCS employees about the service they are delivering for the public in their own opinion.

Table 3.4 MCS's Service Delivery

|  | Participants response |         |          |        |  |  |
|--|-----------------------|---------|----------|--------|--|--|
| Description of statements                    | Strongly              | Partly  | Disagree | Don't  |  |  |
|  | Agree                 | Agree   |          | know   |  |  |
| The institutions' service delivery is        | 24(32%)               | 26(34%) | 22(29%)  | 4(5%)  |  |  |
| improved from time to time.                  |                       |         |          |        |  |  |
| There is a good service delivery to citizens | 24(32%)               | 38(50%) | 12(16%)  | 2(3%)  |  |  |
| in the organization.                         |                       |         |          |        |  |  |
| The time to give services is satisfactory.   | 16(21%)               | 38(50%) | 14(18%)  | 8(11%) |  |  |

The table above indicates that, though there are 22 (29%) respondents disagreeing and 4 (5%) unaware about the improvement of service delivery from time to time, 24 (32%) are strongly agreed on the same statement and 26 (34%) of the total participants are partly agreed.

The assessment about the presence of a good service delivery to citizens in the organization is strongly supported by 24 (32%) and partially favored by 38 (50%). The total participants disagreed on the statement are 12 (16%) and at the same time only 2 (3%) respondents are unaware of the quality of services the organization give.

Time has a crucial value in satisfying or dissatisfying the service seekers. The opinion survey on satisfaction that comes due to timely delivery of services by MCS's employee shows 16 (21%) respondents has react strongly agree, and 38 (50%) participants reply as they disagree partly. Contrary to these opinions, 14 (18%) are totally disagreed on idea stating the time to give services is satisfactory.

#### 3.2.6 Participation, Consensus Oriented, Transparency and Rule of Law

It is understood that, good governance is an ideal concept, which is difficult to achieve in its totality. Among its' characteristics, the table 3.5 below shows the views of respondents in terms of participation, consensus oriented, transparency and rule of law.

Table 3.5 Status of Participation, Consensus Oriented, Transparency and Rule of Law in MCS

|  | I        | Participan | ts respons | se      |
|--|----------|------------|------------|---------|
| Description of statements                              | Strongly | Partly     | Disagree   | Don't   |
|  | Agree    | Agree      |            | know    |
| Decisions that are made by the organization are        | 4(5%)    | 32(42%)    | 22(29%)    | 18(24%) |
| participatory.   |          |            |            |         |
| Discussion of already completed actions, plans and     | 10(13%)  | 18(24%)    | 26(34%)    | 22(29%) |
| engagement of stakeholders to understand and respond   |          |            |            |         |
| their views is part of work in the organization.       |          |            |            |         |
| Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public    | 20(26%)  | 34(45%)    | 16(21%)    | 6(8%)   |
| participation in government policy making and          |          |            |            |         |
| implementation, and allowing contestation over         |          |            |            |         |
| choices impacting on the lives of citizens.            |          |            |            |         |
| Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated | 38(50%)  | 24(32%)    | 4(5%)      | 10(13%) |
| in the mediation of the different interests in the     |          |            |            |         |
| organization to reach a broad consensus.               |          |            |            |         |
| The institution is autonomous to practice its given    | 16(21%)  | 11(14%)    | 2(3%)      | 9(12%)  |
| mandate by the government.                             |          |            |            |         |
| The rules regulations and procedures of the            | 14(18%)  | 30(39%)    | 20(26%)    | 12(16%) |
| organization applied well.                             |          |            |            |         |

The result founded from the opinion survey about participatory decision making in MCS is considered to be less. There are 22 (29%) participants totally disagreed on the existence of participatory decision making and 32 (42%) respondents too disfavored the statement partially. Even if there are strong supporters of the statement amounted to 4 (5%), 18 (24%) participants did not know the operation. On the same way, fewer respondents strongly agree on the statement of discussion on already completed actions, plans and engagement of stakeholders to understand and respond their views is part of work in the organization. 26 (34%) participants totally disagree on the same idea besides the 18 (24%) respondents who gave their opinion by partially disfavoring it and 22 (29%) don't know. But the third statement about the public accounts are verifiability, provision for public participation in government policy making and implementation,

and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens, has better strong supporters compared to organizational participatory decision making and stakeholders participation statements. There are 34 (45%) respondents partially support and 16 (21%) disagreed in addition to 6 (8%) unaware participants about the same idea.

Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus according to the strong view of 38 (50%) participants and 24 (32%) respondents partial support. Whereas, 4 (5%) and 10 (13%) respondents to oppose and being unaware respectively.

The rule of law that the organization has under its mandate is also practically applied based on the observation of strong agreement 16 (21%) and partial support of 11 (14%) respondents. But very few of the remaining have disagreed and 9 (12%) are being unaware. Here also, the rules regulations and procedures of the organization applied well as 14 (18%) and 30 (39%) support strongly and partially correspondingly, but 20 (26%) are totally opposed and 12 (16%) others are unaware.

## 3.2.7 Transparency, Equity and Inclusiveness, Accountability, Efficiency and Effectiveness

The Transparency, Equity and Inclusiveness, Accountability, Efficiency and Effectiveness are some of the remaining characteristics of good governance. To have a full picture of MCS's good governance in the public service, as usual, the table 3.6 below contains some statements and views of sample respondents.

Table 3.6 Status of Transparency, Equity and Inclusiveness, Accountability, Efficiency and Effectiveness in MCS

| Description of statements                                | Participants response |         |          |         |
|--|-----------------------|---------|----------|---------|
|  | Strongly              | Partly  | Disagree | Don't   |
|  | Agree                 | Agree   |          | know    |
| Processes and the institution produce results that meet  | 18(24%)               | 42(55%) | 6(8%)    | 10(13%) |
| the needs of society while making the best use of        |                       |         |          |         |
| resources at their disposal.                             |                       |         |          |         |
| Holding responsible appointed individuals charged        | 12(16%)               | 30(39%) | 24(32%)  | 10(13%) |
| with a public mandate to account for specific actions,   |                       |         |          |         |
| activities or decisions to the public from whom they     |                       |         |          |         |
| drive their authority is common practice.                |                       |         |          |         |
| Every member of the staff feel that they have a stake in | 4(5%)                 | 32(42%) | 34(45%)  | 6(8%)   |
| his organization and do not feel excluded from the       |                       |         |          |         |
| opportunities to improve or maintain their well being.   |                       |         |          |         |
| The human resource recruitment and selection,            | 16(21%)               | 40(53%) | 16(21%)  | 4(5%)   |
| promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the       |                       |         |          |         |
| organization is fair and transparent.                    |                       |         |          |         |

In the practice of producing results that meet the needs of society while making the best use of resources at their disposal in MCS, 18 (24%) respondents strongly agreed, 42 (55%) are partially disagree. While the remaining 6 (8%) totally disagree and 10 (10%) respondents are unaware.

Accountability, as a concept in good governance takes the lion share though, it is considered as a single characteristic. In this case, 12 (16%) respondents strongly agreed on the common practice of holding responsible appointed individuals charged with a public mandate to account for specific actions, activities or decisions to the public from whom they drive their authority in the organization. But, 30 (39%) participants partially and 24 (32%) respondents disagree on this statement. Of all, still 10 (13%) sample respondents are unaware on the same statement.

Equity and Inclusiveness in MCS seem to be given less attention. Only 4 (5%) from all respondents are agreed on the statement that says every member of the staff feel that they have a stake in his organization and do not feel excluded from the opportunities to improve or maintain

their well being. Partially supporting the idea, 32 (42%) of these employees put their opinion. 34 (45%) are opposing the statement and the remaining 6 (8%) did not know the issue.

Fairness and transparency of the human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is said to be exist according to the views of 40 (53%) unfinished and 16 (21%) complete favors. Another group amounting to 16 (21%) prefer to disagree and very few other participants and being without a clue.

#### 3.2.8 MCS Employees' to Organizational Information Access

Information is crucial for good governance as it reflects the activities and processes of the organization. Every employee of the institution has right to access information. The main objective of organization behind providing information to its citizens is to promote openness, transparency and accountability in administration.

The information about the various kinds of services provided to the public is basic input for all employees. The access to particular information, unless it is strictly provided by the government considered to be as a secret, is the right of each citizen as described in "Right to Information Act" of the government of Ethiopia.

The table 3.7 below contains the statements describing the level of information access and the opinions of respondents' in the organization.

**Table 3.7 MCS's Information Access** 

|   | I        | Participant | s response |         |
|---|----------|-------------|------------|---------|
| Description of statements                           | Strongly | Partly      | Disagree   | Don't   |
|   | Agree    | Agree       |            | know    |
| Proper information is given about the mission,      | 50(66%)  | 22(29%)     | 2(3%)      | 2(3%)   |
| vision and values of the organization to employees. |          |             |            |         |
| There is an access of information needed by all the | 24(32%)  | 38(50%)     | 12(16%)    | 2(3%)   |
| staffs.   |          |             |            |         |
| Enough information provided to employees in an      | 10(13%)  | 40(53%)     | 18(23%)    | 8(11%)  |
| easy and understandable forms and media about the   |          |             |            |         |
| organizations decisions.                            |          |             |            |         |
| The public has knowledge of the policies that are   | 12(16%)  | 28(37%)     | 18(23%)    | 18(23%) |
| under the mandate of the institution and confidence |          |             |            |         |
| in its intentions.                                  |          |             |            |         |

Based on 50 (66%) respondents' strong support the organization is giving proper information about the mission, vision and values of the organization for its employees, while 22 (29%) participants have partial reservation, only 2 (3%) prefer to disagree and the remaining 2 (3%) are totally unaware on the statement.

The employees' response about a statement qualifying the accesses of information needed by all the staffs show that there are 24 (32%) participants who are strongly agree, where 38 (50%) partially disagree. Even though, the distribution opinion indicates a good status of information accesses, 12 (16%) respondents also disagree on the idea and 2 (3%) are totally unaware. In the same way, respondents give their opinion on the statement that the information about the organizations' decisions is provided in easily and understandable forms and media. In this statement, 10 (13%) participants are strongly agreed, 40 (53%) partially disagree and 18 (23%) disagreeing. But still, there are 8 (11%) respondents unaware about the issue.

On the statement of the public knowledge about the policies and having confidence in its intentions, only 12 (16%) give their opinion in favor and 28 (37%) participants respond as agreeing partially. On the other hand, the remaining 36 (47%) respondents choose disagree and unaware with an equal proportion of 18 (23%).

#### 3.2.9 Shared Values at MCS

A feature of good governance is the development of shared values, which become part of the organization's culture, supporting policy and behavior throughout the organization, from the governing body to all staff. The table below shows the distribution of different employees' perception about the shared values existing in MCS.

Table 3.8 MCS Employees' Perception of shared values

|   | P        | articipant | s response |        |
|---|----------|------------|------------|--------|
| Description of statements                             | Strongly | Partly     | Disagree   | Don't  |
|   | Agree    | Agree      |            | know   |
| Shared values are part of the organization's culture, | 18(24%)  | 36(47%)    | 16(21%)    | 6(8%)  |
| underpinning policy and behavior throughout the       |          |            |            |        |
| organization, from the governing body to all staff.   |          |            |            |        |
| A formal code of conduct defining the standards of    | 20(26%)  | 22(29%)    | 26(34%)    | 8(11%) |
| behavior to which individual governing body members   |          |            |            |        |
| and all employees of the entity is in practice.       |          |            |            |        |

On the other hand, shared values are part of the organization's culture, underpinning policy and behavior throughout the organization, from the governing body to all staff as 18 (24%) of the respondents strongly agree and 36 (47%) partially agree. But still, there are considerable numbers of respondents amounting to 16 (21%) totally disagreeing on the statement and 6 (8%) others are unaware.

Though, 26 (34%) participants totally disagree on the last statement expressing the existence of practical formal code of conduct defining standards of behavior governing administrators and all employees of the entity, 20 (26%) respondents are strongly agreed and the remaining 22 (29%) and 8 (11%) participants confirmed partially agreed and unaware respectively.

#### 3.2.10 Ethical Based Behaviors in MCS

An ethical code reflects the ideals of sincerity, faithfulness, promise keeping, quest for excellence, fairness, empathy, decency, accountability and consideration for others. In other words, a code of ethics depicts a standard of integrity and competence beyond that required by law. The table 3.9 is presented below to show MCS employees' ethical based behaviors.

Table 3.9 Employees Ethical based behaviors in MCS

| Description of statements                            | Participants response |         |          |         |
|--|-----------------------|---------|----------|---------|
|  | Strongly              | Partly  | Disagree | Don't   |
|  | Agree                 | Agree   |          | know    |
| Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of | 12(16%)               | 50(66%) | 8(11%)   | 6(8%)   |
| their own personal interests.                        |                       |         |          |         |
| Bosses treating every employee in an impartial eyes  | 10(13%)               | 24(32%) | 32(42%)  | 10(13%) |
| Employees are Helpful.                               | 30(39%)               | 38(50%) | 8(11%)   | 0(0%)   |
| Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.         | 40(53%)               | 28(37%) | 4(5%)    | 4(5%)   |
| Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of | 24(32%)               | 46(61%) | 4(5%)    | 2(3%)   |
| people' status, social rank, etc.                    |                       |         |          |         |
| Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.              | 22(29%)               | 40(53%) | 0(0%)    | 14(18%) |
| Employees are Prompt and Efficient.                  | 14(18%)               | 48(63%) | 8(11%)   | 6(8%)   |

The table above shows that 12 (16%) respondents strongly agree and 50 (66%) partially disagree in that employees of MCS serving citizens other than serving the interests of their own. Whereas, 8 (11%) participants are opposing and the remaining 6 (8%) don't know about the service. Being threatened equally and impartially by bosses of an organization indicates there is some existence of leadership ethical behavior. The analysis from the above table on the issue shows that, there are 34 (45%) supporters, of which 24 (32%) are partially and large numbers of others amounting disagree.

About the employees helpfulness, friendly dealing with citizens, equal treatment, reliability, trustworthiness, promptness and efficiency in serving the public, participants strongly agree are ranging 14 (18%) to 40 (53%) in each statement as shown in the table 3.8 above, but large numbers of respondents opinion who were partially disagree fall under the range of 24 (32%) to

48 (63%). Contrary to strongly supporting views, respondents who disagree range 0 (%) to 8 (11%). Also, respondents who are unaware about these services, range between 0 (0%) and 14 (18%).

#### 3.2.11 Structure and Formal Working Procedures of MCS

Establishing effective structural arrangements and working procedures to ensure compliance with all applicable statutes, regulations and other relevant statements of best practice. Public servants need to uphold the reputation of the entity by treating the general public. It is to show the opinions of sample respondents on some statements about structures and formal working procedures in the organization that the table 3.10 below presented.

Table 3.10 Views of Respondents on Structural Arrangements and Working Procedures

|   | P        | articipant | ts respons | e       |
|---|----------|------------|------------|---------|
| Description of statements                               | Strongly | Partly     | Disagree   | Don't   |
|   | Agree    | Agree      |            | know    |
| Employees have job descriptions about their work.       | 26(34%)  | 36(47%)    | 12(16%)    | 2(3%)   |
| There is a proper performance measurement system to     |          |            |            |         |
| formalize the process of tracking progress toward       |          |            |            |         |
| established goals and provides objective justifications | 24(32%)  | 30(39%)    | 12(16%)    | 10(13%) |
| for organizational and management decisions.            |          |            |            |         |
| Many employees believe the existence of an effective    | 8(11%)   | 24(32%)    | 34(45%)    | 10(13%) |
| organizational structure and process.                   |          |            |            |         |
| All employees work by knowing their rights and          | 14(18%)  | 50(66%)    | 8(11%)     | 4(5%)   |
| obligations.  |          |            |            |         |
| There is a proper complaint handling system for         | 16(21%)  | 24(32%)    | 24(32%)    | 12(16%) |
| anybody.  |          |            |            |         |

For simplicity as well as creating effective administration system a contract type of binding agreement, effective performance measurement, effective organizational structure, and strong and formal problem solving mechanisms shall to be designed. These are considered to be employee job description stating all about do's and do not do's, rewarding strategies and ways to put in practice institutional mandates within the limit of every ones' job position.

To assess this, a statement expressing the existence of employees' job description about their work was presented to these participants. As a result, 26 (34%) of the sample respondents have strongly agreed, 36 (47%) partially agreed, 12 (16%) totally disagree and the remaining 2 (3%) are interested to say don't know. From the data, it is clear that not all employees are given work description on their position at any level.

For the practice of proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provision of objective justifications for organizational and management decisions, 24 (32%) and 12 (16%) respondents gave strong support and partial agreement respectively. Oppositely, 12 (16%) and 10 (13%) participants are prefer to view the statement by totally disagreeing and unaware.

Despite 34 (45%) and 10 (13%) disagreement and unawareness level correspondingly, 8 (11%) participants strongly agree on the statement saying that, many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process. But 24 (32%) of the remaining sample respondents has a partial agreement.

A bout the rights and obligations, 14 (18%) participants observe that all employees work by knowing their rights and obligations, where, 50 (66%) are partially agreeing and 8 (11%) of the other group is disagreed but few other numbers of them are unaware. Similarly, in cases of disappointments created at any level, 16 (21%) respondents believe the existence of a proper complaint handling system for anybody. On the other hand, 24 (32%) partially and 24 (32%) of the remaining are totally disproved the supporters' belief about the issue.

#### 3.2.12 Introduction of the Citizen Charter in MCS

Identifying only the way of delivering the expected services to the public in general in an efficient and effective manner is not the only activity of government institutions, but employees too also be well trained, informed and positioned accordingly. Table 3.11 below is all about the introduction of citizen charter.

Table 3.11 Introduction of the Citizen Charter in MCS

| Description of statements                          | Participants response |         |          |         |  |
|--|-----------------------|---------|----------|---------|--|
|  | Strongly              | Partly  | Disagree | Don't   |  |
|  | Agree                 | Agree   |          | know    |  |
| Citizen charter is implemented in the institution. | 30(39%)               | 34(45%) | 12(16%)  | 0(0%)   |  |
| Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in | 22(29%)               | 32(42%) | 10(13%)  | 12(16%) |  |
| the organization.                                  |                       |         |          |         |  |

Here, 30 (39%) of the respondents are observed the citizen charter in the organization, but 34 (45%) of the remaining sample subordinates deny partially and 12 (16%) of others totally disagree on its introduction. Also, 22 (29%) participants have a positive idea about every body's full awareness of the citizen charter in the organization though 32 (42%) view the statement with partial support and 10 (13%) others disagreeing besides 12 (16%) respondents as shown in the table above.

#### **CHAPTER FOUR**

#### 4. Conclusion and Recommendation

#### 4.1 Conclusion

It is evident from the foregoing discussion that the main vehicle of the government is the public service. Building of critical institutional capacities for good governance is a pre-requisite. Nonetheless, any reform to this end should be carefully formulated and implemented, taking into account the specific needs of the public.

Keeping some supporting views on all the 38 survey statements, responses showing many limitations were observed on the assessment. The views of most respondents about characteristics of good governance in their institution, as presented in tables 3.5 and 3.6 indicates that, the MCS has not done a lot on the issue. Indeed, in table 3.2, there is an absolute agreement on participants that good governance is important for public service delivery, but the MCS never seems to use this level of basic awareness on dealing with employees in enhancing their understanding about the concept of good governance in terms of continuous trainings and other supportive mechanisms. In table 3.3 only 8 (10%) respondents believe the existence of effective organizational structure and process and 92% of the remaining participants view the statement in different scenarios too.

In terms of good service delivery at the MCS, respondents ranging only 16 to 24 choose strongly agree where the remaining are viewing indifferently as table 3.4 shows. The public access of information is also limited as table 3.7 shows in the same way, but 66% of the respondents give interesting support for dissemination of information about the organization's mission, vision and values.

It can also be concluded that, the characteristics of good governance are not fully implemented in the institution. Shared values and Ethical values are also other complementary components of good governance. The study also investigates the presence of some possible supports from the views of the participants about those values. There is an implementation of the citizen charter, but as usual, respondents give their opinion in different ways. Some of them confirm its existence, some others disagree, and the remaining are prefer to say unaware about the introduction and implementation of citizen charter.

Generally, this paper has argued that although there are attempts of implementing good governance, a lot work has been not done on the civil servants. As the MCS, holds more responsibilities than any other public institution in the country about public governance, the need to mobilize both the human and capital resources effectively and efficiently is very fundamental activity.

#### 4.2 Recommendation

Given all public institutions have been studied in same way; there might have been probabilities of getting diverse results. Although each case has its own specific challenge and solution, it is important to mention the following recommendations. As a result, establishing a sustainable administrative structure, which can effectively achieve excellence by employing minimum administrative heads supported by a strong human resource capital, can be taken primarily. Secondly, though it is not expected to come up at the same level of agreement in all matters of institutional activities, there need to exist a mechanism of bridging the gaps observed within the employees on the status of institutional good governance characteristics.

#### **4.2.1** Enhancing Institutional Good Governance

Good governance here, shall involve agents of change, processes and mechanisms, value systems, normative orders, technology and resources. The will of the people in solving a problems as well as leadership are critical components of the process. This helps the institutions to implement and disseminate the importance and existence of good governance within. In order to learn from and adapt better solutions the following can be taken:

#### **4.2.2** Enhancing the Structure and Formal Working Procedures

Public sector organizations should constantly monitor citizens' needs and expectations in order to respond to citizens' priorities for service improvement. They should adopt a citizen-centric focus in reviewing and improving the quality of service delivery. This approach is most likely lead to innovations that ensure citizen satisfaction. Consulting with citizens and constantly seeking their feedback will allow public service providers to review successes and past

performance, and set out effective improvements in the future. As a result of all the survey analysis, the following recommendations are listed.

- **A.** Maintaining Organizational Culture Supportive of Innovation: It is a culture conducive to risk taking, initiative, creativity, learning and change. To build a culture supportive of innovation, people's involvement in the organization's business should be optimized. Employees should not simply execute commands from the top, but share in the organization's vision, mission, values and strategy. Besides, building institutional ethics and behavioral values as major components of innovation to be practiced in the best interest of the majority public must be the leading motto of the MCS.
- **B.** Improving Delivery of Services: considerable numbers of respondents in MCS view their service delivery status as it is not good, not satisfactory and even not improved from time to time. To this effect, as changes in access, coverage and speed of service delivery often have an immediate client oriented culture; investment on empowering organization's man power must be given solid attention.
- **C. Reengineering Processes and Working Methods:** simplification of procedures, computerization, improvement of interoffice communication and overhauls in performance appraisal systems have immediate and long term positive effects on reducing budget expenditures and the costs of running an organization, as well as increasing the efficiency of operations and performance.
- **D. Reviewing Institutional Structure:** initiatives that introduce major reforms in the structures of government by, for example, creating new governmental entities, eliminating existing ones and/or shifting responsibilities have to be implemented whenever possible.
- **E. Working on Employees' Mindset, Behavior and Skills:** based the assessment there is also a recommendation about to practice changing the mindset and behavior of public servants. It is due to the fact that, changes in mindset, behavior and skills require willingness and commitment to continuous learning, and capacity to adapt to different circumstances.

#### References

- African development Bank. (2000). *Bank group policy on good governance*. Communications Unit. Abijan.
- African institute of management development and governance. (2008). Ethiopia-Country self assessment report submitted to the governing council of the national African peer review mechanism. Addis Ababa.
- Allan Rosenbaum, (n.d). *Good Governance, Accountability and the Public Servant*. Institute for Public Management and Community Service. Florida International University, USA
- Anwaruddin A. (2005). *Improving Public Service Delivery through Bureaucracy Reform*. Available at: http://mazawang.wordpress.com/2009/12/11/improving-public-service-delivery-throughbureaucracy-reform/ [Accessed on 21 November 2012]
- A.T.M. Obaidullah, (2001). Democracy and Good Governance, the role of Ombudsman. University of Rashahi, Bangladesh.CIPFA (The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy). (2004). The Good Governance Standard for Public Services. Hackney Press Ltd, London
- Downer. (2000) Good Governance, *Guiding principles for implementation*. Ministry of Foreign Affairs. Australia.
- Ethiopian Management Institute. (2012). *Balanced Scored Cared training manual*. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Federal Civil Service Ministry Bulletin (n.d). Communication and international relation Directorate, Addis Ababa-Ethiopia
- Georges Nz. (2011). *Good Governance of public Services*, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill (USA).
- Georges Nzongola-Ntalaja. (2011). *Good Governance of Public Services*. University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill (USA)
- Hari. (2010). *Impact of Citizen Charter in Service Delivery*, A thesis submitted to North south University in Bangladesh.
- IGNOU. (2008). *Public Systems Management* Student book. Vijayalakshmi Works Pvt. Ltd: New Delhi.

- IGNOU. (2009). *State, Society and Public Administration* Student book. Vijayalakshmi Works Pvt. Ltd: New Delhi.
- J. Davis. (2011). Assessing Capacity Building and Good Governance Indicators in Sub-Saharan Africa, The Implications for Poverty Reduction. USA. Available at: <a href="http://www.uneca.org">http://www.uneca.org</a>. [Accessed on June, 2012].
- Manij Upadhyay. (2006). *An Assessment of Good Governance in Community Forestry User Groups*. Tribhuvan University. Hetauda, Nepal. Available at: http://www.forestrynepal.org.pdf [Accessed on June 2012]
- M.Satish, (2004). Civil Service Reforms. Hyderabad.
- Oertel. (2004). Governance profile of Ethiopia. ECA, Addis Ababa
- Omoyefa, P.S (2008). *The Politics of Public Sector Reforms in Africa*. National University of Lesotho. Lesotho.
- Rojina Tamrakar. (2010). *Impact of Citizen Charter in Service Delivery: A Case of District administration Office*, Kathmandu. North South University. Bangladesh.
- Sam Agere, (2000). *Promoting good governance, principles, practices and perspectives*. Commonwealth Secretariat, London.
- Shrestha, B.R. (2000). *Good Governance in Nepal, Perspective form- Panchthar and Kanchanpur Districts, Rural Development Foundation.* Kathmandu, Nepal.
- South Australia Local government. (2010). Good Governance Assessment Program (GGAP) report on 2009/10 validated Results. Australia.
- Starving for good governance in Africa. (2005). Synopsis of the 2005 African governance report prepared for the African development forum IV, pp. 27. Economic Commission for Africa.
- Tarekegn Ararso. (2007). Promoting a culture of good governance through values and outcome based ethics, manual for ethical climate assessment. Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- The International Federation of Accountants. (2001). *Governance in the Public Sector*. New York, United States of America.

- The International Standards of Supreme Audit Institutions, (n.d) *Principles of transparency and accountability*, Denmark. Available at: http://www.intosai.org [Accessed on February, 2013]
- The Australian Government's Overseas Aid Program (2000). *Good Governance, Guiding Principles for implementation*. Australia.
- UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs. (2007). *Public Governance Indicators*. New York, United Nations. Available at: http://www.unpan1.un.org.pdf [Accessed on June, 2012].
- UNDP. (1998). Governance for Sustainable Livelihood: Operational Issues. UNDP.
- Waheduzzaman (2010). People's Participation for Good Governance: A Study of Rural Development Programs in Bangladesh. Bangladesh Agricultural University,
- World Development Report. (2004). *Making Services Work for Poor People*. Available at: http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/fandd/2003/12/pdf/ devaraja.pdf [Accessed on 5 December 2012]
- World Bank. (1996). *Reforming the Public Sector*. Private Sector Development and Finance Division. South Asia Region, Bangladesh
- World Bank (1998). Assessing Aid, What Works, What Doesn't and Why. Washington, DC.

# Annex

#### INDRA GANDHI NATIONAL OPEN UNIVERSITY (IGNOU)

#### MASTER OF ARTS IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MPA) PROGRAM

### A Questionnaire designed for Public service providers (Employees) on the Assessment of Good Governance in Ethiopian Ministry of Civil Service

#### **Dear Participants**;

This questionnaire is designed to assess good governance in relation to the public service in your organization.

I wish to remind you that its use is purely for academic (research) purpose, and the information gathered from this questionnaire is strictly confidential and no answer given by an individual can be identified.

#### **Part A: General Information**

| 1. | Gender; Male Female                                       |
|----|---|
| 2. | Educational Level ;                                       |
| 3. | Your position in the Organization; Head expert and others |
| 4. | No of service years in government organizations;          |

### Part B: Research Information;

**Directions:** Decide and put/√/ on whether you choose strongly agree, partly agree, disagree, don't know.

| S.          |   | Strongly | Partly | Disagree | Don't |
|-------------|---|----------|--------|----------|-------|
| N <u>o.</u> | Description of statements   | Agree    | Agree  |          | know  |
| 1           | Many employees know about Good Governance.                                |          |        |          |       |
| 2           | Language used in the Good Governance easy to read and understand.         |          |        |          |       |
| 3           | The necessary trainings related to good governance are given for          |          |        |          |       |
|             | employees.  |          |        |          |       |
| 4           | Many employees believing the existence of good governance in the          |          |        |          |       |
|             | organization.   |          |        |          |       |
| 5           | Good governance is important in public service delivery.                  |          |        |          |       |
| 6           | Proper information is given about the mission, vision and values of the   |          |        |          |       |
|             | organization.   |          |        |          |       |
| 7           | The institutions' service delivery is improved from time to time.         |          |        |          |       |
| 8           | Decisions that are made by the organization are participatory.            |          |        |          |       |
| 9           | There is a good service delivery to citizens in the organization.         |          |        |          |       |
| 10          | The time to give services is satisfactory.                                |          |        |          |       |
| 11          | There is an access of information needed by all the staffs.               |          |        |          |       |
| 12          | Enough information provided to employees in an easy and                   |          |        |          |       |
|             | understandable forms and media about the organizations decisions.         |          |        |          |       |
| 13          | The public has knowledge of the policies that are under the mandate of    |          |        |          |       |
|             | the institution and confidence in its intentions.                         |          |        |          |       |
| 14          | Every member of the staff feels that they have a stake in his             |          |        |          |       |
|             | organization and do not feel excluded from the opportunities to           |          |        |          |       |
|             | improve or maintain their well being.                                     |          |        |          |       |
| 15          | Processes and the institution produce results that meet the needs of      |          |        |          |       |
|             | society while making the best use of resources at their disposal.         |          |        |          |       |
| 16          | Holding responsible appointed individuals charged with a public           |          |        |          |       |
|             | mandate to account for specific actions, activities or decisions to the   |          |        |          |       |
|             | public from whom they drive their authority is common practice.           |          |        |          |       |
| 17          | The rules regulations and procedures of the organization applied well.    |          |        |          |       |
| 18          | Shared values are part of the organization's culture, underpinning policy |          |        |          |       |
|             | and behavior throughout the organization, from the governing body to all  |          |        |          |       |
| 2           | staff.  |          |        |          |       |

| No. Description of statements Agree Agree know  19 Discussion of already completed actions, plans and engagement of stakeholders to understand and respond their views is part of work in the organization.  20 The institution is autonomous to practice its given mandate by the government.  21 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.  22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are paticipated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  34 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  35 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  36 Employees Reliable and trustworthy. | S.  |   | Strongly | Partly | Disagree | Don't |
|--|-----|---|----------|--------|----------|-------|
| stakeholders to understand and respond their views is part of work in the organization.  20 The institution is autonomous to practice its given mandate by the government.  21 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.  22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees Work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | No. | Description of statements   | Agree    | Agree  |          | know  |
| organization.  20 The institution is autonomous to practice its given mandate by the government.  21 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.  22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees reat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.   | 19  | Discussion of already completed actions, plans and engagement of            |          |        |          |       |
| The institution is autonomous to practice its given mandate by the government.  21 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.  22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees rendly in dealing with citizens.  35 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | stakeholders to understand and respond their views is part of work in the   |          |        |          |       |
| government.  21 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.  22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.   |     | organization.   |          |        |          |       |
| 1 Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes. 2 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice. 2 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process. 2 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody. 2 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions. 3 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus. 4 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization. 4 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens. 4 Imployees are Prompt and Efficient. 4 Employees are Prompt and Efficient. 5 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests. 5 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens. 5 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc. 5 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 20  | The institution is autonomous to practice its given mandate by the          |          |        |          |       |
| 22 A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees reflepful.  35 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | government.   |          |        |          |       |
| individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 21  | Bosses are treating every employee in impartial and equal eyes.             |          |        |          |       |
| practice.  23 Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees reachelpful.  35 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 22  | A formal code of conduct defining the standards of behavior to which        |          |        |          |       |
| Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | individual governing body members and all employees of the entity is in     |          |        |          |       |
| structure and process.  24 There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  25 There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  |     | practice.   |          |        |          |       |
| There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.  There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  Employees are Helpful.  Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 23  | Many employees believe the existence of an effective organizational         |          |        |          |       |
| There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  |     | structure and process.  |          |        |          |       |
| process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  26 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 24  | There is a proper complaint handling system for anybody.                    |          |        |          |       |
| objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.  26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 25  | There is a proper performance measurement system to formalize the           |          |        |          |       |
| 26 Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  |     | process of tracking progress toward established goals and provides          |          |        |          |       |
| the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.  27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.  28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  |     | objective justifications for organizational and management decisions.       |          |        |          |       |
| 27 Citizen charter is implemented in the institution. 28 Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization. 29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens. 30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent. 31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient. 32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations. 33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests. 34 Employees are Helpful. 35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens. 36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc. 37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 26  | Several actors and as many viewpoints are participated in the mediation of  |          |        |          |       |
| Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.  29 Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | the different interests in the organization to reach a broad consensus.     |          |        |          |       |
| Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 27  | Citizen charter is implemented in the institution.                          |          |        |          |       |
| government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 28  | Everybody is fully aware of the Citizen Charter in the organization.        |          |        |          |       |
| over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.  30 The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 29  | Public accounts are verifiable, provided for public participation in        |          |        |          |       |
| The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  Employees are Helpful.  Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  |     | government policy making and implementation, and allowing contestation      |          |        |          |       |
| and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.  31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | over choices impacting on the lives of citizens.                            |          |        |          |       |
| 31 Employees are Prompt and Efficient.  32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 30  | The human resource recruitment and selection, promotion, demotion, exit     |          |        |          |       |
| 32 All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.  33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | and firing policy of the organization is fair and transparent.              |          |        |          |       |
| 33 Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 31  | Employees are Prompt and Efficient.   |          |        |          |       |
| interests.  34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 32  | All employees work by knowing their rights and obligations.                 |          |        |          |       |
| 34 Employees are Helpful.  35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 33  | Employees Serve the interests of citizens instead of their own personal     |          |        |          |       |
| 35 Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.  36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   |     | interests.  |          |        |          |       |
| 36 Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.  | 34  | Employees are Helpful.  |          |        |          |       |
| rank, etc.  37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 35  | Employees Friendly in dealing with citizens.                                |          |        |          |       |
| 37 Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.   | 36  | Employees treat all citizens equally irrespective of people' status, social |          |        |          |       |
|  |     | rank, etc.  |          |        |          |       |
| 38 Employees have job descriptions about their work.   | 37  | Employees are Reliable and trustworthy.                                     |          |        |          |       |
|  | 38  | Employees have job descriptions about their work.                           |          |        |          |       |

| ••••                                    | •      |
|---|--------|
| •••••                                   |        |
| •••                                     | •••••• |
| ••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••••• |        |
| • |        |
|   |        |
|   |        |
|   |        |
|   |        |
|   |        |

| • .                                    | •••••                                   | ••••• | •••• | • • • • • | • • • • • |
|--|---|-------|------|-----------|-----------|
| •                                      |   |       |      |           |           |
| 1                                      |   |       |      |           |           |
| 2                                      | •••••                                   |       |      |           |           |
| 3                                      | •••••• •••• ••• •••• ••••• •••••        |       |      |           |           |
|  | •• •••• •• •• •• •• •• •• •• •• •• •• • |       |      |           |           |
|  | •••• •••• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • |       |      |           |           |
| 6                                      | • |       |      |           |           |
| 7                                      | • |       |      |           |           |
| 8                                      | • |       |      |           |           |
| 9                                      | ••••                                    |       |      |           |           |
| 10                                     | •••••• •••• ••• ••• ••• ••• ••••        |       |      |           |           |
| 11                                     | ••• ••••                                |       |      |           |           |
| 12                                     | •• ••• ••• ••• •• •• ••• ••• ••• •••    |       |      |           |           |
|  | •••••                                   |       |      |           |           |
| 13                                     | ••• ••• ••••• ••• •• •• •• •• ••        |       |      |           |           |
|  | • |       |      |           |           |
|  | • |       |      |           |           |
| 15                                     | ••••• ••• •••• ••••                     |       |      |           |           |
|  |   |       |      |           |           |
| 16                                     | •••••                                   |       |      |           |           |
|  |   |       |      |           |           |
| 17                                     | •••• ••• •••• ••••                      |       |      |           |           |
| 17                                     | •••• ••• ••••                           |       |      |           |           |
| 17                                     |   | ••••  | •••• | • • • • • | •••••     |
| •.                                     | •••••                                   | ••••• | •••• | ••••      | •••••     |
| •.                                     | •••••                                   | ••••• | •••• | •••••     | ••••      |
| •.                                     |   | ••••• | •••• | ••••      | •••••     |
| •.<br>18                               |   | ••••• | •••• | •••••     | •••••     |
| •.<br>18                               |   | ••••• | •••• | •••••     | •••••     |
| •.<br>18<br>19                         |   | ••••• | •••• | •••••     | ••••      |
| •.<br>18<br>19                         |   | ••••  | •••• | •••••     | ••••      |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22             |   | ••••• | •••• | ••••      | ••••      |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23       |   | ••••• | •••• |           | ••••      |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23       |   |       | •••• |           | ••••      |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24 |   |       | •••• |           |           |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24 |   |       | •••• |           |           |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24 |   |       | •••• |           |           |
| 18<br>19<br>20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24 |   |       |      |           |           |
| 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26             |   |       |      |           |           |
| 20<br>21<br>22<br>23<br>24<br>25<br>26 |   |       |      |           |           |

|    | •••••                                   |  |  |
|----|---|--|--|
|    | •••• ••• •••• ••••                      |  |  |
| 31 | •••••                                   |  |  |
| 32 | ••• ••••                                |  |  |
| 33 | • |  |  |
| 34 | •••••                                   |  |  |
| 35 | ••••                                    |  |  |
| 36 | •••••                                   |  |  |
| 37 | ••••                                    |  |  |
| 38 | •••••                                   |  |  |